

Debate Reflection Assignment 1

Purpose:

The overall purpose of the debates in class is to enhance all students' learning. This will happen in a different way if you are a debate participant or not. But preparing for the debate, presenting (or listening), and reflecting on what happened will reinforce both the particular material being covered during the debate as well as the methodology of philosophical argumentation and progress.

Our first debate will focus on the debate between naturalism and normativism in defining health and disease. The particular debate resolution for the first debate is this:

Resolved: Normative considerations are an essential component of the proper definitions of health and disease.

Below are the assignments for the debate participants and the debate listeners respectively.

A. For Debate Participants

Task:

Write a 1-2 page reflection that addresses the following:

1. Identify the strongest argument your team prepared and evaluate how well it was communicated.
2. Discuss the most challenging argument made by the opposing team and how persuasive you found it.
3. Reflect on your team's division of roles and debate strategy. What worked? What would you change?
4. Explain whether participating in the debate shifted your view of naturalism or normativism, and why.
5. Conclude with your own philosophical position: which framework (naturalism, normativism, hybridism, or eliminativism) do you find most persuasive, and why?

B. For Debate Observers

Task:

Write a 2–3 page reflection that addresses the following:

1. Summarize the strongest argument presented by each team.

2. Evaluate which team made the more effective case and explain why.
3. Identify one issue or objection you wish had been addressed more fully.
4. State your own philosophical position: which framework (naturalism, normativism, hybridism, or eliminativism) do you find most persuasive, and why?
5. Reflect on how watching the debate differed from only reading the texts—did it help clarify or complicate the issues?